Multilocus Genotypes, a Tree of Individuals, and Human Evolutionary History

Joanna L. Mountain¹ and L. Luca Cavalli-Sforza²

¹Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley; and ²Department of Genetics, Stanford University, Stanford

Our goal is to infer, from human genetic data, general
parterns as well as details of human evolutionary his-
parterns as well as details of human evolutionary his-
orce. These data make horsible the consideration of mul-

For decades, population-genetic data have held the from the data for individuals corresponds with the poppromise of providing insight into human evolutionary ulation affiliation of those individuals; that is, all indihistory. For much of this period, individuals were tested viduals of each group fall into a single cluster in the tree. for very few genetic loci. Researchers therefore summa- The relationship between population history and a tree rized these data at the population level, inferring trees inferred from data for individuals depends on many facof populations on the basis of allele frequencies (Ed- tors, as discussed below. In a general sense, this apwards and Cavalli-Sforza 1964; Cavalli-Sforza 1967; proach parallels that of Cockerham (1969, 1973), who Cavalli-Sforza and Edwards 1967; Nei and Roychoud- (along with authors mentioned therein) considered a hihury 1974). They then interpreted such trees in terms of erarchical structure of individuals within isolates within population relationships and major human migrations. subpopulations and examined the correlations between Understanding that a strictly bifurcating tree is unlikely genes sampled from within each of these levels. to reflect human history very accurately, a few research- The first segment of DNA sequence to be studied in

Summary ers went a step further by inferring population admix-

consistency either at a regional level (fig. 1*c*) or at both **Introduction** the regional and the population levels (fig. 1*d*). By the term "consistency" we mean here that the tree inferred

detail, for samples from individuals of several human populations, was the mitochondrial genome. Aquadro Received July 15, 1996; accepted for publication June 10, 1997. and Greenberg (1983), Johnson et al. (1983), Cann et Address for correspondence and reprints: Dr. Joanna L. Mountain, al. (1987), and Vigilant et al. (1989) were among the Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley, earliest to infer relationships Department of Integrative Biology, University of California, Berkeley,
CA 94720-3140. E-mail: joanna@mws4.biol.berkeley.edu
© 1997 by The American Society of Human Genetics. All rights reserved. genomes. Since then, thousa 0002-9297/97/6103-0029\$02.00 of populations have been examined. Although some re-

tency between regional or population affiliation (*a*) and corresponding

searchers have found population-specific mutations, STR, or microsatellite, polymorphisms have provided trees inferred from these sequences or haplotypes are the opportunity for consideration of a large number of generally inconsistent with population affiliation; that is, unlinked loci for each of many individuals. Bowcock et sequences very often cluster most closely with sequences al. (1994) typed individuals from 14 populations, for 30 obtained from samples of a different population (fig. microsatellite markers (polymorphisms). They estimated 1*b*). One plausible explanation for this inconsistency genetic distances between individuals, considering the between the mtDNA gene tree and population history level of allele sharing between individuals. From these is that much of the polymorphism observed for mtDNA genetic distances they inferred a tree of individuals. The probably predates population separations (Takahata level of consistency between this tree and population 1989). Furthermore, because the mitochondrial genome affiliation is relatively high; that is, the tree is close to undergoes no recombination, the 16,569-bp genome be- the pattern shown in figure 1*d.* Most Asian samples haves evolutionarily as a single locus. Inferences from clustered together, as did most European samples, most any one such locus lack robustness (Pamilo and Nei Amerindian samples, and most African samples. A more 1988). detailed discussion of the level of consistency is given

Although the known polymorphisms of the Y chro- below. mosome are very few, this chromosome might poten-
The current study involves a large number of nuclearnent specific. A C \rightarrow T transition is limited to Amerindian phisms will reveal the extent of agreement between a Ychromosome gene tree and population affiliation. Wong 1993).

For at least two reasons, only a few segments of the autosomal nuclear genome have been sequenced for a large number of individuals. First, long stretches (several kilobases) of nuclear DNA must usually be examined in order to detect more than one or two variable sites. Second, the sequencing of alleles of diploid nuclear genes is more challenging in that cloning is generally required. Among the segments that have been examined closely are the HLA complex of loci on chromosome 6 and the b-globin gene cluster on chromosome 11. These data are possibly more difficult to interpret than mtDNA sequences, because gene conversion and recombination within the loci may have taken place. Although a few haplotypes appear to be population specific, trees inferred from HLA sequences are essentially inconsistent with population affiliation (Belich et al. 1992). In fact, Figure 1 Schematic representation of consistency and inconsis-

tency between regional or population affiliation (a) and corresponding level (within-species divergence between individuals is gene or individual trees $(b-d)$. *a*, Hypothetical population history. sometimes greater than between-species divergence), in-
A parent population separates into two regional groups (circles vs. dicating that natural selec A parent population separates into two regional groups (circles vs.

triangles), which, in turn, separate into two populations (blackened

vs. unblackened symbols). *b*-*d*, Hypothetical trees inferred from data

for indiv with both regional and population affiliation. c , Clustering consistent the β -globin locus are generally found in multiple popuat the regional level but not at the population level. *d*, Clustering lations (Wainscoat et al. 1986), indicating either exten-
consistent at both the regional level and the population level. A fourth size gene flow among consistent at both the regional level and the population level. A fourth
possibility, consistency at the population level but not at the regional
level, is not shown.
population separations, or some combination of these factors.

tially be studied as has the mitochondrial genome; that DNA genetic markers: RFLPs. We considered genotypes is, gene trees might be inferred. Of the known Y-chro- for ≤ 100 polymorphisms of 12 individuals from each mosome polymorphisms, at least two appear to be conti- of 12 populations. These polymorphisms are believed of 12 populations. These polymorphisms are believed to have a low mutation rate, between $10^{-5}/$ generation males (Underhill et al. 1996), whereas an A \rightarrow G transi- (for electrophoretic loci; Neel et al. 1986) and 10^{-7} / tion is limited to African males (Seielstad et al. 1994). generation (for nucleotide sites; Nei 1987). Eighty-four Other haplotypes, such as ALU+ chromosomes, are of the markers are biallelic, and most alleles are found
found in only a few geographic locations (Hammer in all populations. This is in contrast with microsatellite in all populations. This is in contrast with microsatellite 1994; Hammer and Horai 1995). Additional polymor- (i.e., STR) loci, which have a much higher mutation rate (on the order of $10^{-3}/$ locus/generation; Weber and tions. First, is an individual tree inferred from these data Samples of Chinese individuals born in mainland China consistent with regional and population affiliation (as and living in the San Francisco Bay Area were collected in fig. 1*d*)? What does the extent of consistency between by L. Wang and L. L. Cavalli-Sforza. The Europeans these two trees tell us about the time of separation of sampled were local residents of the Stanford University the groups studied, the level of gene flow among the and Yale University areas and were primarily northern groups, and the degree of substructure within these Europeans. The Italian sample was collected by A. Pigroups? Have sufficiently many genetic markers been azza and colleagues, from the town of Trino in northern tested to allow us draw conclusions? In order to inter- Italy. This sample has been described in detail by Mapret consistency or the lack thereof, we need to consider tullo et al. (1994). The Japanese sample, collected by L. mode of inheritance, mutation rates, mutational mecha- Wang and A. Lin in 1986, consists of individuals born nisms, population sizes, sample sizes, and number of in Japan and living in the San Francisco Bay area. The loci tested. We have obtained, through simulation, ex-
Melanesian samples, from Bougainville in the Solomon pectations regarding consistency between individual Islands, were collected by J. Friedlander. The Melanetrees and population histories, given the number of loci sian sample of 12 includes two pairs of related individuexamined, sample sizes, population sizes, and popula- als (a parent-offspring pair and an uncle-niece pair), betion-separation times. We use the results of this simula- cause data for 12 unrelated individuals were tion study to interpret the trees of individuals inferred unavailable. The Biaka Pygmies from the Central Afrihere. can Republic, sometimes called ''western Pygmies,''

scribed below were included in this study. Selection of Cavalli-Sforza and B. Hewlett. The Mbuti Pygmies of individuals for analysis was based on the number of the Ituri forest in northeastern Zaire appear to be the genotypes available. All individuals are unrelated, ex- least admixed with neighbors among the Pygmy populacept for two pairs of Melanesians. Their population af- tions. They are also known as the ''eastern Pygmies.'' filiation was determined in any of a number of ways: These samples also were collected by L. L. Cavallithrough self-identification, consideration of language or Sforza and B. Hewlett. The Senegalese sample is from geographic location, the tracing of the individual's gene- the Niokolonke of the Mandenka population in the eastalogy, or a combination of these. The term ''population'' ern part of the Senegal and was collected in 1990 by A. is used here loosely and includes both broadly defined Langaney and colleagues (Tiercy et al. 1992; Poloni et groups, such as northern Europeans (Bowcock et al. al. 1995). 1987), and more narrowly defined groups, such as the African Pygmies (collected in single villages). The set of Sample Processing and DNA Analysis populations includes the regions of Africa, Asia, Europe, For all except the Australian and New Guinean samand Oceania but not the Americas. Genotypes for ≤ 100 ples, blood was drawn and Epstein-Barr virus transfor-
RFLPs were obtained on the 144 individuals. Each indi-
mation was performed on the B cells, as described els vidual, therefore, is represented by a set of genotypes where (Anderson and Gusella 1984; Bowcock et al. that we call a ''multilocus genotype''; these multilocus 1987). The extraction of DNA from cell lines was pergenotypes were the basis for the analyses discussed be- formed as described by Bowcock et al. (1987). Austra-

Cambodians, Chinese, Europeans, Italians, Japanese, 1987). Descriptions of the 100 polymorphisms tested Nasioi Melanesians, coastal New Guineans, highland have been given elsewhere (Bowcock et al. 1987, 1991*a*). New Guineans, Biaka Pygmies, Mbuti Pygmies, and Sen- Of these polymorphisms, 84 are biallelic among the 144 egalese Mandenka. Australian and New Guinean DNA individuals whereas 8 reveal 3 alleles; the remaining 8 samples were provided by A. Wilson; these have also polymorphisms reveal 4–10 alleles. Of the 100 polybeen described elsewhere (Cann et al. 1987; Stoneking morphisms, some are very closely linked: a total of 73 et al. 1990). The New Guineans include 12 individuals independent loci (42 genes and 31 anonymous DNA from the highland regions and 12 individuals from the segments) were considered. coastal areas of Papua New Guinea. Cambodian sam- Although not all individuals were tested for all poly-

Given such a data set, we can ask a number of ques-
living in Santa Ana, CA) were collected by K. Dumars. have been shown to be a 70%–75% admixture (of unknown date) with other Africans, mostly of Nilo-Sa- **Subjects and Methods** haran or Bantu origin (Wijsman 1986; Cavalli-Sforza et Twelve individuals from each of the 12 groups de- al. 1994, p.90). These samples were collected by L. L.

mation was performed on the B cells, as described elselow. lian and New Guinean DNA samples were extracted from placentas, as discussed by Stoneking et al. (1990). Sources of the Population Samples Southern blotting, hybridization, and autoradiography The 12 populations considered here are Australians, were then performed for all samples (Bowcock et al.

ples (from Khmer individuals born in Cambodia and morphisms, all calculations involving any particular pair

Number of Markers per Pair of Individuals

^a CAR = Central African Republic Pygmy; ZAI = Zaire Pygmy; CHI = Chinese; MEL = Melanesian; NEU = northern European; JPN = Japanese; $AUS =$ Australian; NGh = New Guinea highland; NGc = New Guinea coastal; CAM = Cambodian; SEN = Senegalese; and TRO = Trino Italian.

of individuals were performed considering all markers considered, thereby eliminating any artificial consistency that had been tested for that pair of individuals. Table due to input order. We partitioned the latter tree into 1 gives both the average number of markers considered major clusters by dividing the tree along its longer interfor pairs of individuals from within each population and nal branches. As stated above, a tree is considered conthe average number of markers considered for pairs of sistent, at some level, if all individuals of a particular individuals from two different populations. sample or set of samples form a single cluster (monophy-

als, *m* and *m'*, was summarized by means of an allelesharing distance, $D_{(m,m')}$, as follows:

$$
D_{(m,m')}=\frac{1}{l}\sum_{j=1}^l d_{(m,m')j}\;,
$$

identical genotypes at locus *j* (e.g., AA:AA or AB:AB), has the greatest consistency with population affiliation? .5 if one individual has only a single allele in common Are any individuals outliers in both trees? Are there any with the other individual (e.g., AB:AA or AB:AC), and pairs of individuals who cluster in both trees? 1.0 if the individuals have no alleles in common (e.g., $AA:BB$). In this manner, a 144 \times 144 interindividual Very Recent Immigration Events genetic-distance matrix was generated. In order to determine whether

Letic group) in the tree and if no other individuals are
found in this cluster (see fig. 1). In a perfectly consistent
The genetic difference between each pair of individu-
tree, therefore, each population forms a single, tree, therefore, each population forms a single, separate *cluster* (fig. 1*d*). We have not attempted to quantify the level of consistency.

We compared the tree inferred from RFLP genotypes to a tree inferred, in a similar manner, from microsatellite loci (Bowcock et al. 1994). Because only a subset of individuals from a subset of populations was considered where *l* is the number of loci for which both individuals in both studies, we compared the tree positions of these have been tested, and $d_{(m,m')}$ = 0 if the individuals have individuals only. We asked several questions: Which tree

In order to determine whether some of the recent ancestors of any of the 144 individuals may have immi-Tree Inference Tree Inference and their current population, we performed two We inferred trees of individuals for each pair of the types of tests. We first performed tests for each individ-12 populations, from the genetic distances, according to ual, in order to assess whether that individual or any the neighbor-joining algorithm (Saitou and Nei 1987). recent ancestor(s) had immigrated from a particular We also inferred a tree relating all of the 144 individuals. population. The test compared the probability under The Jumble option of the NEIGHBOR program the hypothesis that his or her multilocus genotype was (Felsenstein 1989) was invoked; this option randomizes derived from the individual's population versus the the order in which the individuals in the input file are probability under the hypothesis that the multilocus genotype was derived from another population (Shriver et the first, because no explicit alternative hypothesis is al. 1997; Rannala and Mountain, in press). Specifically, being tested. for each individual *m* for each locus *j* (with *kj* alleles), we calculated the probability of his or her genotype Simulation Study (X_{ijm}) , given the allele frequencies (x_{ji}) in that individu-
We performed a simulation study in order to facilitate al's population *i*: the interpretation of individual trees such as those in-

$$
Pr(X_{ijm}|x_{ji}) = \begin{cases} x_{bij}^2 & \text{if } X_{ijm} = bb \\ 2x_{bij}x_{gji} & \text{if } X_{ijm} = bg \end{cases}
$$

 $\neq h$ and x_{hji} is the frequency of allele *h* at locus *j* in population *i.* The probability of the individual's set of tions, for each locus, we generated a coalescent tree for genotypes was then the product of these single-locus the sample of 2*n* genes (Hudson 1990). probabilities. We similarly calculated the probability of In order to simulate changes in population size, we the individual's set of genotypes, given the allele frequen- followed the suggestion of Hudson (1990). He outlines cies in one of the other populations *i*was the ratio of these two probabilities. In performing in population size. In these cases, time is scaled in terms this test, we assumed that all genetic loci under consider- of 2*N* generations, where *N* is the current effective popuation are in linkage equilibrium (Rannala and Moun- lation size (at time $t = 0$). We considered 2-fold, 5-fold, tain, in press).
and 10-fold population expansions at time t_e in the past.

frequencies. In order to assess the significance of this to the present time $(t = 0)$.
probability, we used a Monte Carlo approach, generat-
From the set of genotypes for these $4n$ simulated indiprobability, we used a Monte Carlo approach, generat-

ferred from multilocus RFLP genotypes. Specifically, we $Pr(X_{ijm}|x_{ji}) = \begin{cases} x_{bij}^2 & \text{if } X_{ijm} = bb \\ 2x_{bij}x_{eij} & \text{if } X_{ijm} = bg \end{cases}$, considered samples of size *n* that were drawn from two populations, of size *N*, that had been isolated from one another for time *t* (measured in unit *2xhipper is a populations, of size N, that had been isolated from one* another for time *t* (measured in units of 2*N* generations). We fixed the number of biallelic genetic loci under confor all $h = 1, 2, ..., k_j$ and $g = 1, 2, ..., k_j$ where *g* sideration. We used a coalescent approach to simulate $\neq h$ and x_{hi} is the frequency of allele *h* at locus *j* in the evolutionary process: for each of the two popula

> a coalescent approach to simulation of a sudden change and 10-fold population expansions at time t_e in the past.

We approximated the null distribution of the ratios Having generated a coalescent tree for each populaby means of a Monte Carlo procedure (Rannala and tion, either with or without population expansions, we Mountain, in press). Specifically, we generated 2,500 truncated each tree at time *t* in the past, thereby generat-''individuals'' (sets of genotypes for multiple loci), given ing a set of genes ancestral to the present-day sample, the allele frequencies of the population. For each of these drawn from the parent population at time *t.* In order to sets of genotypes, we calculated a ratio of posterior assign genotypes to the *n* individuals of each present-day probabilities. We then used this distribution to estimate sample, we first chose, randomly (uniform distribution), the probability of the observed ratio under the null hy- allele frequencies for the genes of the parent population pothesis of no recent immigration. This procedure en- at time *t.* All genes present in the parent sample at time abled us to identify those individuals whose genotypes *t* were randomly assigned an allelic type on the basis of were significantly more likely (at the 1% level) to have these allele frequencies. We assumed the mutation rate been derived from another population than would be at these loci to be so low as to be negligible. This asexpected on the basis of population-allele frequencies. sumption is likely to be valid, given that the great major-We also performed power calculations for each individ- ity of the alleles at the RFLP loci are believed to have ual, to determine whether the genotypes and allele fre- arisen prior to the initial divergence among the ancestors quencies provide sufficient statistical power to detect of extant, modern humans (Mountain and Cavalliindividuals with some immigrant ancestors. For further Sforza 1994). Furthermore, for most polymorphisms, all details of the test, see the work of Rannala and Moun- alleles are found in most populations. Therefore, in the tain (in press). Note that, for this test, either the source simulation, all descendants of an ancestral gene present population or a population closely related to the source at time *t* received the allelic type of that ancestral gene. population must be included. Genotypes for *n* individuals from each of the two popu-The second test examined the probability that each lations were generated by random pairing of the 2*n* individual's genotype was drawn from his or her popula-
tion, where that population is defined by its set of allele for which polymorphism remained in the two samples for which polymorphism remained in the two samples

ing 1,000 random ''individuals'' by drawing multilocus viduals, we estimated allele-sharing genetic distances begenotypes based on the population's allele frequencies. tween individuals. From these distances we then inferred For each individual, we calculated the probability that a tree. Finally, we examined the consistency of this tree; his or her genotype was drawn from the population. a tree with all individuals of each sample falling into a We then compared the observed probability with the single cluster was considered consistent (fig. 1*d*); any distribution under the null hypothesis of no recent immi- other configuration was considered inconsistent. For gration. This test is more simple but less powerful than each set of parameters, we performed 1,000 simulation

runs; for example, for the case of 100 loci with a given separation time *t,* we generated 100,000 total pairs of coalescent trees. We then determined the proportion of these 1,000 runs that resulted in consistent trees (as in fig. 1*d*).

Results of Simulation Study

We found that the number of loci tested had a strong impact on consistency. Consideration of only 50 loci led to a probability of consistency $\langle .35, .5 \rangle$ for samples of size 10 from two populations that had been isolated for time, $t = .1$ (corresponding to 2,000 generations, for populations of effective size 10,000). Consideration of 100 loci, however, increased this probability to \sim .75, whereas consideration of 1,000 loci increased the probability to \sim .99 (fig. 2*a*). If we assume that human generations are of length 25 years, this result implies that, even if two populations are isolated from one another for as long as 50,000 years, 50 loci— and even 100 loci— are too few to allow us to expect perfect consistency between the tree and population affiliation. For shorter separation times, we are even less likely to observe consistency. Once the time of separation is as large as $t = .2$ (in terms of 2*N* generations), however, even as few as 50 loci are very likely $(P > .9)$ to lead to consistent trees. The number of individuals sampled per population plays a role as well, but, although increasing the number of individuals from 10 to 25 does reduce consistency somewhat, this effect is less dramatic than that of the number of loci (J. L. Mountain, unpublished simulation results).

We also explored the impact that population expan-
Figure 2 Probability of consistency of tree of 10 individuals doubled in size at time $t_e = .04$, the probability increases the assumption that the two population that the two populations separated 10-fold the past. For further details, see text. to nearly 50% (fig. 2*b*). If the sizes increased 10-fold more recently than time $t_e = .025$ ago, the probability of consistency is essentially 1.0 (fig. 2*b*). Thus, even if populations have not been isolated from one another in figure 3 and table 2. The Melanesian and New Guinea

genetic distance. These 10,296 distances are summarized individuals from the three Australian/New Guinean

sions have on the consistency between an inferred indi-
from each of two populations, obtained through simulation. Probabilividual tree and the population affiliation of individuals ties are given for simulations considering genotypes for 50, 100, 250,
(for 2b). This impact depends highly on the time to as or 1,000 polymorphic loci/individual. (fig. 2b). This impact depends highly on the time, t_e , as
well as on the size of the expansion. Recent expansion
(wherein both populations have reached size N only
recently) has the greatest impact. Consider the case of populations. $t = .1$, for example, corresponds to 50,000 years, under the assumptions that two populations have effective sizes of 10,000 75 loci examined for each of 10 individuals from each the assumptions that two populations have effective sizes of 10,000 of two populations that separated at time $t = 0.05$ in the individuals and that generations are of of two populations that separated at time $t = .05$ in the individuals and that generations are of length 25 years. *b*, Expanding populations. Each population is assumed to have reached its current past. Without any expansion, the probability of consis-

effective size *N* after a 2-fold, 5-fold, or 10-fold expansion at time *t_e* tency is very low (\sim 6%). If instead the populations both in the past. Simulations were performed considering 75 loci and under doubled in size at time t_e = .04, the probability increases the assumption that the two

for long, if they have only recently reached their current highland samples have the smallest average betweensize, then trees inferred for individuals from these popu- individual distances, whereas the two European samples lations are likely to be consistent. (northern European and Trino) have the largest average between-individual distances (table 2). The Australian **Results** sample has the largest range of between-individual distances (fig. 3). The smallest average distances are found Genetic Distances from Multilocus Genotypes for individuals from within each of two clusters of popu-For each pair of the 144 individuals, we estimated a lations: individuals from the three African samples and

Histograms of genetic distances, $D_{(m,m')}$, between pairs of individuals (*m* and *m*^{\prime}) in each sample. Abbreviations are as in table 1. 4. For 11 of 13 within-region cases, the trees are incon-

ble 2). The smallest average distance (.238 \pm .045), for European and/or Australian samples.
instance, is for the comparison of the two New Guinea All populations.—From the genetic samples, as might be expected. The largest average dis-
individuals, we inferred a tree according to the neighbortances are found for comparisons of individuals of Afri- joining algorithm (fig. 5). We have labeled nine clusters can versus Oceanic, African versus Asian, and Oceanic in the tree, each defined by an internal branch (*A*-*I*). versus Asian samples (table 2). The largest average dis- Although these clusters are somewhat arbitrary, other

Table 2

Figure 4 Summary of trees inferred for individuals from each pair of populations. $C =$ tree of 24 individuals, which is consistent with population affiliation (fig. 1*d*); and $x =$ tree of 24 individuals, which is inconsistent with population affiliation. Triangles include within-region results; and rectangles include between-region results.

tance (.386 \pm .045), for example, is for the comparison of the Mbuti Pygmy sample from Zaire with the sample from Cambodia.

Inferred Individual Trees

Two populations/tree.—For each pair of populations, Figure 3 Histograms of genetic distances, $D_l m, m'$), between we inferred a tree of the 24 individuals, from the genetic distances. Results of this analysis are provided in figure. sistent. The exceptions are the trees of Melanesian and New Guinean individuals. Of the 53 between-region samples are most genetically similar to one another (ta- cases, only 15 are inconsistent. All of these cases involve

All populations.—From the genetic distances between

NOTE.—Abbreviations are as defined in footnote to table 1.

Figure 5 Tree inferred from between-individual genetic distances, according to the neighbor-joining algorithm (Saitou and Nei 1987). A total of 144 individuals from 12 samples of four world regions are represented. Small curved bars crossing interior branches partition the tree into nine clusters (A-I, excluding three outliers), corresponding to those of table 4. Lowercase letters (a-x) indicate those individuals whose genotypes appear likely (at the 1% significance level) to have been derived from another population. An asterisk (*) indicates that an individual's multilocus genotype is significantly improbable (at the 5% level), given the allele frequencies of its own population.

a single cluster (B) , the European samples are somewhat scattered. European samples fall into two clusters with The consistency of the 12 population tree (fig. 5) re-

partitions are likely to generate similar conclusions, Oceanic individuals and into two clusters with Asian given the small number of internal branches. In general, individuals. The Oceanic samples as a group fall into each sampled individual falls within a cluster with other several clusters. One of these (*D*) is associated with a members of his or her regional group. All individuals European cluster (*B*) and a mixed European/Australian sampled in Africa, for instance, fall into a single cluster cluster (*C*). The others (*E* and *G*) form a larger cluster (*A*), as do 33 of 36 individuals of Asian origin (cluster with a mixed European/Australian cluster (*F*). The com- $H + I$). Although 13 of 24 European individuals form position of these roughly defined clusters is summarized a single cluster (*B*), the European samples are somewhat in table 3.

Table 3

Composition of Clusters of Tree Shown in Figure 5

NOTE.—Population samples have been grouped according to their regions of origin.

the tree is roughly consistent at the regional level (as a population other than their own but from within their shown schematically in fig. 1*c*), within-region consis- own region. Seven of these eight individuals fall into tency at the population level is rare. The Melanesian clusters with other members of their region, as is ex-Japanese, and two northern European), at least half of genotypes appeared to be consistent with affiliation with the individuals form clusters, of two or three each, with at least one population from another region of the other members of their population sample. The Cambo- world. Of these 16, 7 fall into clusters consisting primardian, Chinese, Australian, and Italian individuals, on ily of individuals of another region— that is, are outliers. the other hand, fall more often into small clusters with These individuals are the most likely to be of mixed

New Guineans as two samples (those from the highland tions. regions and those from coastal areas). Although these We located each of the 24 individuals who may have two groups do not form distinct clusters in the tree mixed ancestry in the tree shown in figure 5, and in 9 shown in figure 5, highland individuals form pairs in 8 cases we found them to be outliers— that is, clustered of 12 cases, and coastal individuals form pairs in 6 of with members of other regional groups. For instance, 12 cases. In no instance does a highland individual form the three Asian individuals $(i - k)$ not included in any of a pair with a coastal individual. The nine clusters each have genotypes consistent with

als some of whose recent ancestors appear to have immi- tions. An Italian individual (o) with significant ratios grated from another of the populations. Although, of falls into a mixed cluster (*F*). The only Melanesian samthe 1,584 tests, we would expect 1%, or \sim 16, to give ple (q) falling outside of the Melanesian cluster appears significant results by chance, many more (45) showed similar to the coastal New Guinean sample. Two Austrasignificance. We identified 24 individuals (3 African, 5 lians fall into small clusters with European individuals. European, 4 Asian, and 12 Oceanic) whose genotypes The multilocus genotype of one of these individuals (f in are significantly different (at the 1% level) from the ex- cluster *C*) appears similar to those of the two European pectation under a null hypothesis of no recent immigra- samples and the Chinese sample, whereas that of the tion (fig. 5 and table 4). The genotypes of eight of these other (n in cluster *F*), remarkably, appears similar to

flects that of the two population trees (fig. 4); although individuals appeared to be at least partially derived from sample, with 11 of 12 individuals falling into a single pected. The exception is the Australian, ''n,'' with a set cluster (*E*), is an exception. For seven of the remaining of genotypes that appears to be derived from several population samples (three African, two New Guinean, populations (table 4). In the remaining 16 cases, the members of other samples. Overall, 65 of 144 individu- ancestry. Power calculations indicated that, in all but als are most closely associated, in this tree, with mem- 10 of the 1,584 tests, the power (probability of rejecting bers of their own sample.
 the null hypothesis when it is false) is >.95. All of the
 Previous analyses indicated that genotype frequencies
 exceptions are for comparisons of northern European exceptions are for comparisons of northern European for the combined New Guinean sample (coastal plus individuals versus the Italian (Trino) sample. The allele highland individuals) deviated from those expected un-
frequencies in these two samples are so similar that there der the assumption of Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (Lin is insufficient power, with the available number of loci, et al. 1994). We therefore chose to consider the set of for detection of immigration between the two popula-

allele frequencies in non-Asian populations. Of the four Very Recent Immigration Events European individuals, two (v and w in clusters *H* and By performing 1,584 (144 individuals \times 11 popula- *I*) who fall into the Asian clusters have genotypes consistions) ratio tests, we were able to identify those individu- tent with allele frequencies in one or more Asia tent with allele frequencies in one or more Asian populasimilar to the coastal New Guinean sample. Two Austra-

Table 4

Twenty-Four Individuals Identified as Possibly Having Mixed Ancestry, on the Basis of the Ratio Test, Given Individual's Set of Genotypes for Multiple Loci

	AFRICA			EUROPE		OCEANIA				ASIA		
	CAR	ZAI	SEN	NEU	TRO	AUS	MEL	NGh	NGc	CAM	CHI	JPN
CAR ZAI		\underline{b}^{**}	$\underline{\mathbf{b}}$		\overline{a}	C^*						
NEU TRO	d		d^{**}	\overline{o}	e		$\mathbf{0},\mathbf{w}^*$			v^* *		v^* , w
AUS MEL	<u> n</u> ∗∗	n∗∗	\boxed{n}	$f^*, \boxed{\underline{n}}*$	f^* 1**		\underline{n}	$\overset{g^{**}}{=}$ \boxed{m}	q^*	$\boxed{\underline{n}}$, $\boxed{\underline{p}}$	$f^{**}, \boxed{\underline{n}}$ **, $\boxed{\underline{p}}$ **	$\boxed{\underline{n}}$ *, $\boxed{\underline{p}}$ **
NGh NGc						$\lfloor \underline{h} \rfloor$	S	\underline{t}^{**}		$\underline{\mathbf{r}}$		u^*
CAM JPN	\mathbf{k}		$\frac{1}{4}$	k	1 ¹		\underline{x}		$\underline{\mathbf{x}}$			X^*

NOTE. For details of the test, see the text and the paper by Rannala and Mountain (in press). For these tests, the significance level obtained through the Monte Carlo approach is $P < 0.01$ (specific *P* values for some entries are given below). Designations of individuals (a-x) are as defined in figure 5. Each individual is located within the row of his or her own sample and in the column(s) of the sample(s) to which his or her multilocus genotype appears to be similar. Underlining denotes that the individual was also considered in the STR tree (Bowcock et al. 1994); and a full box denotes that the individual falls outside his or her regional cluster in the STR tree.

 $* P < .001.$

** .001 $P < 0.005$.

have an immigrant ancestor from a population not con-

al. 1994). Within the regional groups, some population tree appear as a clustered pair in the STR tree.

those of eight different samples, including African, samples, such as the Karitiana, fell into a single cluster. Asian, and European population samples. Close to half of the individuals considered in this micro-Examining the probability that each individual's ge- satellite study have also been examined in the RFLP notype was drawn from his or her population, we de- genotype analysis. We were able, therefore, to compare tected no individuals whose genotypes appear improba- the trees inferred from the two types of markers. The ble (at the 1% level) under a hypothesis of no recent STR study included 148 individuals (including five pairs immigration. The genotypes of 11 individuals appeared related) from 14 populations, whereas the RFLP study improbable at the 5% level. These individuals are indi-
included 144 individuals (including two pairs related) cated by an asterisk (*) in figure 5. Because of the large from 12 populations. Sixty-seven individuals from eight number of tests performed (144), we expect to see seven populations were considered in both studies. Both trees significant cases simply by chance. Our detection of 11 show consistency at the regional level, in that African individuals is somewhat higher than this, and we there- individuals tend to cluster, as do Asian, Oceanic, and fore conclude that a subset of these individuals is likely European individuals. There are 16 exceptions in the to have immigrant ancestry. Of the 11 individuals, 6 STR tree (dividing the tree into five regional clusters), are among the 24 individuals whose genotypes showed and there are 14 exceptions in the RFLP tree (dividing significance in the ratio tests described above. Several of the tree into one African cluster [*A*], one Asian cluster the remaining five individuals are found at the tips of $[H + I]$, one European cluster [*B*], and two Oceanic the longer branches in the tree. These individuals may clusters $[C + D$ and $E + F + G$]). At the population clusters $[C + D$ and $E + F + G$). At the population level, the Melanesians cluster in both trees. Other popusidered in this study. lations (e.g., Central African Republic Pygmy and Zaire Pygmy) cluster more consistently in the STR tree. This Comparison with STR Tree of Individuals may be due, in part, to the smaller number of individuals In a previous study of 30 STR (i.e., microsatellite) considered per population, the inclusion of more related markers, a tree relating 148 individuals was inferred. pairs, and the consideration of a different set of popula-Of these 148, 129 fell into a clustered pair with an tions. At the lowest possible level of clustering, only individual from their own global region (Bowcock et twice do two individuals who are paired in the RFLP

degree of consistency at the regional level, they are both The tree relating 144 individuals, inferred from an less consistent at the population level, and they differ average of 75 RFLP genotypes/individual is roughly dramatically in the details. Nonetheless, some individu-
als appear to be outliers in both data sets. Of the 16 for two populations of different regions are most often als appear to be outliers in both data sets. Of the 16 for two populations of different regions are most often
outlying individuals in the STR tree, 10 are also outliers consistent (70% of cases). The latter trees most clo in the RFLP study. We find that, of these 10, 7 (h, i, k, parallel those examined in the simulation study de-
m, n, p, and x; fig. 5 and table 4) have significantly low scribed above. These simulations suggest two models ratios, given their multilocus RFLP genotypes. Given human evolution (without and with a population size that 24 of the 144 individuals in the RFLP study show increase) that would lead to consistency between an indithat 24 of the 144 individuals in the RFLP study show increase) that would lead to consistency between an indi-
significance, we expect $\lt 2$ of the 10 STR outlying indi-
vidual tree and population history. Considering t significance, we expect \leq of the 10 STR outlying indi- vidual tree and population history. Considering the re-
viduals to show significance by chance. There is evidence sults in figure 2a, we would conclude that the r from two independent studies, therefore, that many, if groups have been effectively isolated from one another not all, of these seven individuals are of mixed ancestry. $f_{\text{or }t} = .10-0.15$; these are the values for which

We have examined the multilocus RFLP genotypes of

constant effective size of \sim 10,000 individuals during
144 that/indulas from 12 populations of Africa, Asia, spand to 2,000-3,000 generation, these altation bitset. The

expectations, at least under a set of simplified models. Admixture and Gene Flow among Populations In that study, we considered the effects of the length The lengths of separation times suggested above were of time that populations have been isolated from one obtained on the assumption that there is complete isolaanother, of population expansions, of the number of tion of populations, after separation. They therefore individuals per population included, and of the number might be termed ''effective'' separation times, analogous of loci tested. Results of those simulations enable us to to effective population sizes. Such estimated effective begin to interpret the tree of individuals. times would be shorter than actual separation times, if

Although the two data sets lead to trees with a similar Implications of Simulation Study for Present Analysis

average of 75 RFLP genotypes/individual, is roughly consistent (70% of cases). The latter trees most closely scribed above. These simulations suggest two models of sults in figure 2*a*, we would conclude that the regional for $t = .10 - .15$: these are the values for which 100 and 50 loci, respectively (we considered an average of 75 **Discussion** loci), lead to an \sim 70% chance of consistency. If it is assumed that populations have maintained a roughly

gene flow had taken place among populations after they gene flow from Southeast Asia to northwestern Australia had separated. It may well be that the populations has had a major genetic impact (Roberts-Thomson et within regional groups separated as long as $50,000 - 1$ al. 1996). According to that study, populations from the 75,000 years ago but that gene flow among the popula- central part of the continent appear to have received less tions continued thereafter. At this point we have incor- immigration from outside Australia. porated neither gene flow nor population admixture into the simulation study, and so we have yet to determine Population Samples and Tree the magnitude of the effect of these factors on the pattern The tree shown in figure 5 and the trees summarized of consistency of the individual tree. Models incorporat- in figure 4 are possibly the consequence not only of the ing admixture and gene flow are certainly necessary to history of these populations but also of the particular consider; although strictly bifurcating models are un- nature of these samples. As indicated above, for examlikely to represent the evolutionary history of modern ple, the Australian sample may include some individuals factors might be reasonably realistic. There is evidence, European and Oceanic individuals appear in the tree. for example, that the European population arose as an More generally, these samples were certainly not seadmixture, having originated through direct or indirect lected as a random global sample of 144 individuals. genetic contributions from neighboring Asian and Afri- Nor were the 12 populations chosen at random; instead,

from an independent set of DNA markers, that a number less consistency. An additional complicating factor is of the 144 individuals are of mixed ancestry (table 4). the bias in the ascertainment of these polymorphisms Three of these individuals (i-k) appear as the outliers (Mountain and Cavalli-Sforza 1994; Rogers and Jorde in the tree shown in figure 5. Several others (f, n, o, v, 1996). Most were included for study because they were and w) fall into clusters with members of other regions. found to be polymorphic in a small European sample. Individuals i, k, and n not only are found to have signifi- The heterozygosity values for the European samples, cantly low ratios in the immigration test but also appear therefore, are higher than for those for other samples. as outliers in both the STR tree and the RFLP tree. These This may have reduced the consistency of the European individuals are very likely to have immigrant ancestry. sample. Eleven individuals (denoted by an asterisks in fig. 5) In summary, we have inferred a tree relating 144 indihave improbable genotypes, if it is assumed that there viduals sampled from 12 populations of four world rehas been no recent immigration and in view of the allele gions. Such a tree enables us to summarize the genotype frequencies of their populations. Of these 11, some have data at the level of the individual, eliminating the usually genotypes that appear to have been drawn from other necessary assumption that all individuals are equally populations, whereas others are peripheral in the tree representative of their populations. This tree is consisshown in figure 5. The latter may have ancestors from tent at the regional level, with exceptions, but is inconpopulations not considered in this study. sistent at the population level. Simulations indicate that

locus haplotypes of Oceanic populations, indicated that as many as $\geq 50,000$ years, populations within regions

humans, bifurcating models that incorporate the two of mixed ancestry. This may explain why clusters of can populations (Bowcock et al. 1991*b*). they were selected, at least in some cases, because the populations were believed to have been relatively free Trees and Recent Immigration Events of recent admixture. We would therefore expect a tree We find strong evidence, from these data as well as inferred for samples chosen at random to show much

Only the Senegalese and Chinese samples appear to the extent of consistency at the regional level may have include none of these possibly mixed individuals; other resulted either from isolation of these regions for samples include several. Four of the 12 Australian indi $\geq 50,000$ years or from a shorter isolation period with viduals, for instance, have multilocus genotypes that subsequent population expansion. The lack of consissubsequent population expansion. The lack of consismight easily have been drawn from other populations. tency at the population level may be the result of rela-The histograms shown in figure 3 reveal a similar pat- tively short separation times among populations within tern, in that the Senegalese and Chinese genetic distances regions (with no gene flow or admixture). Other possible fall within a much narrower range than do those of the explanations for the lack of consistency include the for-Australian sample. This finding is consistent with the mation of populations through admixture and the interconclusion, reached elsewhere (Lin et al. 1994), that mixing of populations through gene flow. We have identhe Australian sample is mixed. Such mixture is likely, tified a subset of individuals some of whose ancestors considering that samples (placental tissue from individu- may have recently immigrated to the current population. als at a hospital) were initially obtained for the purpose These individuals too have probably reduced the consisof studying mtDNA; sample collection may have been tency of the tree. We conclude that the data are consisconducted without extensive information on paternal tent with the hypothesis that, although regional groups ancestry. A separate study, which considered α -globin- may have been effectively isolated from one another for

much shorter length of time.
In the future larger studies including >1,000 poly- Cavalli-Sforza LL (1967) Human populations. In: Alexander

morphisms tested in hundreds of individuals from nu-
marous ground the world, should provide more. Madison, pp 309–331 merous groups around the world, should provide more-
robust results. With such data we may also begin to
compare individual trees and gene trees inferred from
different segments of the human nuclear and mitochon-
drial gen that influence the pattern of the tree. Consideration of Cockerham C (1969) Variance of gene frequencies. Evolution the roles of sampling strategy, mutation, admixture, and 23:72–84 gene flow warrant further study. (1973) Analyses of gene frequencies. Genetics 74:679–

M. Slatkin, Z. Yang, and two anonymous reviewers for valu-
able suggestions and/or discussion: B. Rannala for suggesting. Hammer MF (1994) A recent insertion of an Alu element on able suggestions and/or discussion; B. Rannala for suggesting
the ratio test for immigration; R. Nielsen for suggesting a
second test for immigration; and E. Minch for providing sub-
routines. We also thank those who provi GM20467 to L.L.C.-S. Oxford, pp 1–44

-
-
-
-
- markers in five populations from four continents. Gene
- Bowcock AM, Hebert JM, Mountain JL, Kidd JR, Rogers J, 58 DNA markers in five human populations from four conti-
- Bowcock AM, Kidd JR, Mountain JL, Hebert JM, Carotenuto L, Kidd KK, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1991*b*) Drift, admixture, Nei M, Roychoudhury AK (1974) Genic variation within and and selection in human evolution: a study with DNA polymorphisms. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 88:839–843 and mongoloids. Am J Hum Genet 26:421–443
- JR, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1994) High resolution of human evo- species trees. Mol Biol Evol 5:568 –583 lutionary trees with polymorphic microsatellites despite a Poloni ES, Excoffier L, Mountain JL, Langaney A, Cavalli-
- have probably been isolated from one another for a Cann RL, Stoneking M, Wilson AC (1987) Mitochondrial
	- In the future, larger studies, including $\geq 1,000$ poly-
Cavalli-Storza LL (1967) Human populations. In: Alexander
In the future or politician in the function of individuals from nu-
R (ed) Heritage from Mendel. Univers
		-
		-
		-
		- 700
- Edwards AWF, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1964) Reconstruction of Education of **Acknowledgments** evolutionary trees. Syst Assoc Publ 6:67-76
	- We thank L. Jin, A. Lin, E. Minch, R. Nielsen, B. Rannala, Felsenstein J (1989) PHYLIP—phylogeny inference package

	Slatkin Z. Yang, and two apopumous reviewers for you
		-
		-
		-
- Johnson MJ, Wallace DC, Ferris SD, Rattazzi MC, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1983) Radiation of human mitochondria DNA **References** types analyzed by restriction endonuclease cleavage pat-
	-
- Anderson MA, Gusella J (1984) Use of cyclosporin A in establishing Epstein-Barr virus transformed human lymphoblastoid cell lines. In Vitro 20:856-858

Aquadro CF, Greenberg BD (1983) Human mitochondrial

MA variation and
	-
- B alleles in two tribes of Brazilian Indians. Nature 357:326-
329 Mountain JL, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1994) Inference of human
weogle AM, Buggi C. Hebert IM, Vidd IP, Vidd VV, Fried evolutionary history through cladistic anal Evolutionary history through cladistic analysis of nuclear
laender JS, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1987) Study of 47 DNA DNA restriction polymorphisms. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA
markers in five populations from four continents. Gene 9
	- Geogr 1:47–64
Weel JV, Satoh C, Goriki K, Fujita M, Takahashi N, Asakawa
Wecock AM, Hebert IM, Mountain II, Kidd IR, Rogers J. [-I, Hazama R (1986) The rate with which spontaneous Kidd KK, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1991*a*) Study of an additional mutation alters the electrophoretic mobility of polypeptides.
58 DNA markers in five human populations from four conti-
Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 83:389–393
	- nents. Gene Geogr 5:151–173
weock AM, Kidd IR, Mountain II., Hebert IM, Carotenuto versity Press, New York
		-
- Bowcock AM, Ruiz-Linares A, Tomfohrde J, Minch E, Kidd Pamilo P, Nei M (1988) Relationships between gene trees and
	- constraint in allele length. Nature 368:455 –457 Sforza LL (1995) Nuclear DNA polymorphism in a Man-

- Rannala B, Mountain JL. Detecting immigration using trees. Genetics 122:957 –966 multilocus genotypes. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA (in press) Thompson EA (1975) Human evolutionary trees. Cambridge
- Roberts-Thomson JM, Martinson JJ, Norwich JT, Harding University Press, Cambridge RM, Clegg JB, Boettcher B (1996) An ancient common ori-

gin of aboriginal Australians and New Guinea Highlanders Jeannet M, Mach B, Langaney A (1992) HLA-DR polymorgin of aboriginal Australians and New Guinea Highlanders
- Rogers AR, Jorde LB (1996) Ascertainment bias in estimates Hum Genet 51:592–608
of average heterozygosity Am I Hum Genet 58:1033–1041 Underhill PA, Li J, Zemans R, Oefner PJ, Cavalli-Sforza LL
- method for reconstructing phylogenetic trees. Mol Biol Evol and its implications for human Natl Acad Sci USA 93:196–200
- 4:406-425

Seielstad MT, Hebert JM, Lin AA, Underhill PA, Ibrahim M,

Vigilant L, Pennington R, Harpending H, Wilson AC (1989)

Vollrath D, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1994) Construction of hu-

man Y-chromosomal haplotypes using a
-
- a recent evolutionary divergence for Beringian and northern

North American populations. Am J Hum Genet 53:549-

S62

Shriver MD, Smith MW, Jin L, Marcini A, Akey JM, Deka

R, Ferrell RE (1997) Ethnic-affiliation estimatio 957–964 448
- Stoneking M, Jorde LB, Bhatia K, Wilson AC (1990) Geo- (1986) Estimation of genetic admixture in Pygmies. In: New Guinea. Genetics 124:717–733 lando, pp 347–358
- denka population from Senegal: comparison with eight Takahata N (1989) Gene genealogy in three related populaother human populations. Ann Hum Genet 59:43–61 tions: consistency probability between gene and population
	-
- is supported by α -globin haplotype analysis. Am J Hum phism in a Senegalese Mandenka population: DNA oligo-Genet 58:1017–1024 typing and population genetics of DRB1 specificities. Am J
Specific LB (1996) Ascertainment bias in estimates Hum Genet 51:592–608
- of average heterozygosity. Am J Hum Genet 58:1033–1041 Underhill PA, Li J, Zemans R, Oetner PJ, Cavalli-Storza LL
Saitou N, Nei M (1987) The neighbor-joining method: a new (1996) A pre-Columbian Y chromosome-specific trans
	-
	-
	-
	- population-specific DNA markers. Am J Hum Genet 60: Icelanders and the Ashkenazi Jews. Hum Genet 67:441–
957–964
	- graphic variation in human mitochondrial DNA from Papua Cavalli-Sforza LL (ed) African pygmies. Academic Press, Or-